



Istanbul :  
Sayı :  
Our Reference : 2772  
Konu :  
Subject : Paris MoU 2017 Yıllık Denetim Raporu Hk.

11.07.2018

**Sirküler No: 420 /2018**

**İlgi** : Uluslararası Deniz Ticaret Odası(ICS) ‘nın 04.07.2018 tarihli ve LA(18)30 sayılı yazısı

İlgi yazıda özetle,

-Paris Memorandumu (MoU) kapsamında hazırlanan 2017 Yıllık Değerlendirme Raporunda, Polonya ve Kore Cumhuriyeti’nin “**Beyaz Liste**” ye dahil olduğu, İran İslam Cumhuriyeti, Rusya Federasyonu, Kazakistan ve Amerika Birleşik Devletleri’nin Beyaz Liste’den “**Gri Liste**” ye gerilediği, geçen sene değerlendirilmeye alınmayan Tuvalu’nun “**Gri Liste**” ye girdiği, 2016 yılında 12 Ülke “**Kara Liste**” de iken 2017 yılında Ukrayna ile birlikte “**Kara Liste**” deki Ülke sayısının 13’ e yükseldiği, Kongo Cumhuriyeti’nin ikinci kez en düşük performans gösteren ülke olduğu, 2015 yılından bu yana 65 kez gemilere liman giriş yasağı uygulandığı, 2016 yılında gemilere uygulanan 20 liman giriş yasağına karşı, 2017 yılında bu sayının 33’e yükseldiği, gemi denetlemelerinde tespit edilen kusur oranının (% 3.82) ise geçen seneki oranlarla (%3.84) benzerlik göstererek sabit kaldığı, aynı şekilde tutulmaya sebep olan kusur sayısında da hemen hemen bir değişiklik olmadığı (2016 yılı 3781, 2017 yılı 3706), denetleme sayısında 2016 yılına göre (2016’da, 17842 iken 2017’de 17916) hafif bir artış görüldüğü,

-Geçen 3 yıl içerisinde 62 geminin çoklu kusur ve 3 geminin, bakım ve onarım için yönlendirildiği tersane ve havuzlama işlemine riayet göstermediği gerekçesiyle limana girişlerine izin verilmediği (banned), son 3 yıl içerisinde limana girişlerine izin verilmeyen gemiler arasında en çok Moldova Cumhuriyeti, Tanzanya Birleşik Cumhuriyeti, Togo Cumhuriyeti bayraklı gemilerin olduğunun görüldüğü, Paris Memorandumunda 2017 yılında, “**Beyaz listede 40, Gri listede 20 ve Kara Liste’de 13** olmak üzere, toplamda 73 ülkenin değerlendirilmeye alındığı, tüm denetimlerin % 51’lik kısmının; İspanya, İtalya, Birleşik Krallık, Rusya Federasyonu, Hollanda, Kanada ve Fransa’da gerçekleştirildiği, 2017 yılında Kara Listeyi oluşturan Ülke bayrağına sahip gemiler arasında 1216 denetime karşılık, 2016 verilerinden (%18.71) daha düşük olan % 16.8 oranla 205 kusur bulunduğu, Gri Listedeki ülke gemilerinde ise yapılan denetimlerde kusur bulunma oranının 2016 yılına göre artış gösterdiği, 2016 yılında % 5.5 iken 2017’de bu oranın %7.4’e yükseldiği, Beyaz Liste’de ise 2017 yılı oranlarının 2015 ve 2016 yılının oranlarıyla(% 2.5) aynı olduğu,

-Denetimler sonucu tespit edilen, sıklıkla görülen kusur ve eksiklikler arasında ilk beşte , % 4.35 oran ve 1,774 kusurla ISM ilk sırada yer alırken, sırasıyla %2.51’lik oran ve 1024 kusurla “**yangına dayanıklı bölgelerdeki kaporta giriş ve çıkışları**” ikinci sırayı, % 2.28 oran ve 929 kusurla “**notik neşriyat (yayın)**” üçüncü sırayı, %1,96 oran ve 797 kusurla “**deniz haritaları**” dördüncü sırayı ve %1.46 oranla 594 kusur ile “**sefer ve seyir planlama**” beşinci sırayı aldığı, 2016 yılındaki kusur ve eksiklik oranları sıralamasının ilk dördü 2017 yılı ile aynı iken 2016 yılında beşinci sıradaki “**yağ kayıt defteri**” konulu kusur oranı, yerini “**sefer ve seyir planlamaları**” na bıraktığı,

Raporda Türkiye açısından bakıldığında ise ;

-Bayrağımızın halen beyaz listede olduğu (Beyaz Listedeki 40 ülkeden 39. sırada),

-Düşük riskli ülke bayrağı kriterlerini karşılayan ülkeler arasında yer aldığı,

Ayrıntılı Bilgi: Serkan İNAL Telefon: +90 212 252 01 30/157 e-mail: serkan.inal@denizticaretodasi.org.tr



Meclis-i Mebusan Caddesi No:22 34427 Fındıklı – İSTANBUL / TÜRKİYE  
Tel: +90 212 252 01 30 (PBX) Fax: +90 212 293 79 35  
www.denizticaretodasi.org.tr e-mail: iletisim@denizticaretodasi.org.tr  
www.chamberofshipping.org.tr e-mail: contact@chamberofshipping.org.tr





-2017 yılında Türk bayraklı gemilere Paris MoU kapsamında gerçekleştirilen 327 denetimin 209'unda bir kusur ve eksiklik kaydedildiği,

-Bu denetimlerde Türk bayraklı 14 geminin tutulduğu ve denetlenen gemi ile tutulan gemi sayısı oranının % 4.3 olması sebebiyle % 3.8 olan genel tutulma ortalaması üzerindeki ülkeler arasında kalındığı,

-Klas Kuruluşları Performans Tablosunda ise Türk Loydu' nun yüksek performans gösteren tanınan kuruluşlar (Recognized Organizations) arasında yer aldığı görülmekte olup,

Paris Memorandumu tarafından yayımlanan 2017 Yılı Değerlendirme Raporunun tamamına [www.parismou.org/sites/default/files/2017%20Annual%20ParisMoU\\_0.pdf](http://www.parismou.org/sites/default/files/2017%20Annual%20ParisMoU_0.pdf) linkinden ulaşılabilmektedir.

Bilgilerinize arz ve rica ederiz.

Saygılarımızla,

İsmail ASASOĞLU  
Genel Sekreter V.

**EK:** İlgili yazı ve Ekleri (8 sayfa)

**DAĞITIM:**

**Gereği:**

- Tüm Üyelerimiz (Web Sayfasında)
- Türk Armatörler Birliği
- S.S. Gemi Armatörleri Mot. Taş. Koop.
- Vapur Donatanları ve Acenteleri Derneği
- 26,35,36,37 ve 44 No'lu Meslek Grupları Üyeleri
- Gemi Brokerleri Derneği
- Tüm Gemi Acentaları
- Gemi Sahibi Firmalar

**Bilgi:**

- Ulaştırma ve Altyapı Bakanlığı
- Deniz ve İçsular Düzenleme Genel Müdürlüğü
- Meclis Başkanlık Divanı
- Yönetim Kurulu Başkan ve Üyeleri





This Circular and its attachments (if any) are confidential to the intended recipient and may be privileged. If you are not the intended recipient you should contact ICS and must not make any use of it.

04 July 2018

**LA(18)30**

**TO: LABOUR AFFAIRS COMMITTEE**

**Copy: ALL FULL AND ASSOCIATE MEMBERS (for information)**

**2017 ANNUAL REVIEW OF PARIS MOU**

**Action Required: *Members are invited to note that the 2017 Annual Paris MoU report was issued on 3rd July 2018. A copy of the full report is attached. This is also available on the Paris MOU website. Key points are highlighted below.***

Executive summary

The “White list” is similar to 2016 (42). This year had two new entries to the “White List”; Poland and the Republic of Korea. The Islamic Republic of Iran, Kazakhstan, the Russian Federation, and the United States of America moved from the “White List” to the “Grey List”. Last year’s non listed Tuvalu entered the “Grey List”.

New to the “Black List” is Ukraine. In 2017 13 flags were on the “Black List” (12 in 2016), the Republic of the Congo recording the worst performance for the second year in a row.

Refusal of access (banning) has been used 65 times since 2015.

This year’s report again shows a large increase from 20 bans in 2016 to 33 bans. The detention percentage stabilized to 3.82% (from 3.84%). The number of detainable deficiencies has stabilized as well at 3,706 (from 3,781 in 2016). The number of inspections conducted was 17,916, slightly higher than 2016 (17,842).

Over the past three years 62 ships were banned for multiple detentions and three ships were banned “failing to call at an indicated repair yard”. Ten ships have been banned for a second time.

Over a three year period the flags of the Republic of Moldova, the United Republic of Tanzania and Togo were recorded for the highest number of bannings.

Reviewing the Paris MoU “White, Grey and Black List” the overall situation regarding the quality of shipping appeared to be stabilizing. Although some flag States have moved between lists, the total amount of 40 flags were recorded.

For several years the Paris and Tokyo MoU have made a joint submission to IMO addressing the correlation between flags and the ROs working on their behalf. The results are also published in the Annual Report. It is useful information for the industry in determining the risks posed by substandard shipping. After a slight decrease of the total number of

inspections last year, the number has increased in 2017 to 17,916. The increase of the detention percentage from 3.42% in 2015 to 3.84% in 2016 has stabilized this year at 3.82%. The level of detainable deficiencies stabilized this year to 3,706 (to 3,781 in 2016).

As the states with the most ship calls Spain, Italy, United Kingdom, Russian Federation, the Netherlands, Canada and France, together comprised over 51% of the total number of inspections, but each member contributes to the inspection efforts by a fair share mechanism. With 1,216 inspections and 205 detentions the ships flying a “Black listed flag” had a detention rate of 16.8%, which is less than the 18.71% in 2016. For ships flying a “Grey listed flag” the detention rate was 7.4%, higher than 2016: 5.5%. For ships flying a “White listed flag” the detention rate is 2.5% is at the same level as 2016 (2.6%) and 2015 (2.5%).

The five most frequently recorded deficiencies in 2017 were “ISM” (4.35%, 1,774), “fire doors/openings in fire-resisting divisions” (2.51%, 1024), “nautical publications” (2.28%, 929), “charts” (1.96%, 797) and “voyage or passage plan” (1.46%, 594). The first four are consistent with 2016. The “voyage or passage plan” has replaced “oil record book”. Relatively the total number of the top five is slightly decreasing from 12.9% in 2016 to 12.6% in 2017.

### Paris MoU developments

Once a year the Port State Control Committee, the executive body of the Paris MoU, meets in a member State to consider policy matters concerning regional enforcement of port State control, it reviews the work of the Technical Evaluation Group and task forces and decides on administrative procedures. The task forces, of which 12 were active in 2017, are each assigned a specific work programme to investigate improvement of operational, technical and administrative port State control procedures. Reports of the task forces are submitted to the Technical Evaluation Group (TEG) at which all Paris MoU members and observers are represented. The evaluation of the TEG is submitted to the Committee for final consideration and decision-making. The MoU Advisory Board advises the Port State Control Committee on political and strategic matters, and directs the task forces and Secretariat between Committee meetings. The Board meets several times a year and was composed of participants from Canada, Iceland, Finland, the United Kingdom and the European Commission in 2017. The methodology to calculate flag and recognized organization (RO) performance, used to target ships for inspection, is being reviewed. The Committee agreed to move to a new scheme to replace the current White-Grey-Black List and RO performance List in the near future.

High importance was given to the report of the Concentrated Inspection Campaign (CIC) on MLC, 2006, (carried out from September to November 2016). The general conclusion was that the results show a proper implementation of the MLC requirements on board the ships inspected, and compliance on the MLC areas within the questionnaire.

### Port State Control Committee

The Port State Control Committee held its 50th meeting in Gdańsk, Poland from 22-26 May 2017. The Paris MoU comprises 27 member States. The Paris MoU welcomed the “Ministerial Declaration” signed during the third Joint Ministerial Conference between the Paris and Tokyo MoUs held in Vancouver earlier that month. The declaration demonstrates that the Paris MoU and Tokyo MoU members agree on the importance to safeguard responsible and sustainable shipping in order to further enhance safety, environmental



protection and working and living conditions for seafarers and provides the political support to undertake port State control initiatives between the two regions. It reviewed the following facts and figures for 2017.

The detention percentage for 2017 is similar to 2016; 3.82% related to 3.84%. The numbers on refusal of access have increased again in 2017; 33 compared to 20 in 2016.

## Inspections

With a total number of 17,916 inspections performed in 2017, the figures are similar to 2016 (17,842). The average of number of inspections per ship of 1.17 times per year, equals 2016.

## Deficiencies

The number of deficiencies have stabilized over the past 3 years: 41,820, 41,874 and 40,742 in 2017. This is reflected in the percentage of inspections performed and one or more deficiencies were recorded: 53% (2015), 52% (2016) and 52% (2017). The average number of deficiencies per inspection of 2.3 equals 2016. Compared to 2016, the number of detentions is the same; 685 detentions. The average detention rate in 2017 is 3.82%. In 2016 the detention rate was 3.84%.

## “White, Grey and Black List”

The “White, Grey and Black (WGB) List” presents the full spectrum, from quality flags to flags with a poor performance that are considered high or very high risk. It is based on the total number of inspections and detentions over a 3-year rolling period for flags with at least 30 inspections in the period. On the “White, Grey and Black List” for 2017, a total number of 73 flags are listed: 40 on the “White List”, 20 the “Grey List” and 13 the “Black List”. In 2016 the number of flags listed totaled 73 flags also; 42 on the “White List”, 19 on the “Grey List” and 12 on the “Black List”.

The “White List” represents quality flags with a consistently low detention record. Compared to 2016, the number of flags on the “White List” has decreased by two, again a decrease as from 2016 to 2015 (one). The Republic of Korea has moved back to the “White List” after one year “Grey List”. Poland has entered the “White List” as well.

Flags with an average performance are shown on the “Grey List”. Their appearance on this list may act as an incentive to improve and move to the “White List”. At the same time flags at the lower end of the “Grey List” should be careful not to neglect control over their ships and risk ending up on the “Black List” next year. On this year’s “Grey List” a total number of 20 flags is recorded. Last year the “Grey List” recorded 19 flags.

New on the “Grey List” are the Islamic Republic of Iran, Kazakhstan, the Russian Federation, the United States of America, which were on the “White List” last year. A non-listed flag in last year’s entry and now on the “Grey List” this year is Tuvalu.

New to the “Black List” is Ukraine.

A graph of the distribution on this year’s “Grey List” a total of 20 flags is recorded. Last year the “Grey List” recorded 19 flags. New on the “Grey List” are the Islamic Republic of Iran, Kazakhstan, the Russian Federation, the United States of America, which were on the

“White List” last year. A non-listed flag in last year’s entry and now on the “Grey List” this year is Tuvalu.

New to the “Black List” is Ukraine. A graph of the distribution of listed and non-listed flags indicates that only 0.8% of the ships inspected are from flags not listed on the WGB List.

#### Ship type

In 2017 the top 5 detention rates for ships with a significant number of inspections are for: commercial yachts (7.7%), general cargo/multipurpose ships at 7.7% (up from 7.2% in 2016); heavy load (4.3% up from 1.2%), bulk carrier at 3.0% (down from 3.4%) and at the same score other special activities and Ro-Ro passenger ship at 2.2%.

Although “other” is not a specific type, the detention rate is high with 4.8%.The combination carrier (16.7%) shows a large percentage, but it is a score of one detention related to 6 inspections.

Best performing ship types are NLS tankers with a zero detention rate and tug (1.2%).

#### Performance of Recognized Organizations

For several years the Committee has closely monitored the performance of ROs acting on behalf of flags. To calculate the performance of the Recognized Organizations, the same formula to calculate the excess factor of the flags is used. A minimum number of 60 inspections per RO is needed before the performance is taken into account for the list. In at the same score other special activities and Ro-Ro passenger ship at 2.2%. Although “other” is not a specific type, the detention rate is high with 4.8%.The combination carrier (16.7%) shows a large percentage as well, but it is a score of one detention related to 6 inspections. Best performing ship types are NLS tankers with a zero detention rate and tug (1.2%).

#### Performance of Recognized Organizations

For several years the Committee has closely monitored the performance of ROs acting on behalf of flags. To calculate the performance of the Recognized Organizations, the same formula to calculate the excess factor of the flags is used. A minimum number of 60 inspections per RO is needed before the performance is taken into account for the list. In 2017 34 ROs are recorded on the performance list.

Compared with last year’s performance level, a small shift in RO performance in 2017 can be noticed. This year three organizations have been placed in the very low performing parts against none last year. Three organizations have been placed in the low performing parts (4last year) and 17 ROs have been placed in the medium part of the list (from 19 last year).Details of the responsibility of Recognized Organizations for detainable deficiencies have been published since 1999. When one or more detainable deficiencies are attributed to a Recognized Organization in accordance with the Paris MoU criteria, it is recorded “RO responsible” and the RO is informed.

#### Detainable deficiencies

The increasing trend for detainable deficiencies has stabilized in 2017.Related to 2015 (3,541) and 2016 (3,781) the number of detainable deficiencies in 2017 was 3,706.



## Detentions

Some deficiencies are clearly hazardous to safety, health or the environment and the ship is detained until they are rectified. Detention rates are expressed as a percentage of the number of inspections, rather than the number of individual ships inspected to take account of the fact that some ships are detained more than once a year listed: 40 on the “White List”, 20 on the “Grey List” and 13 on the “Black List”. In 2016 the number of flags listed totaled 73 flags also; 42 on the “White List”, 19 on the “Grey List” and 12 on the “Black List”. The “White List” represents quality flags with a consistently low detention record. Compared to 2016, the number of flags on the “White List” has decreased by two, again a decrease from 2016 to 2015 (one). The Republic of Korea has moved back to the “White List” after one year “Grey List”. Poland has entered the “White List” as well. Flags with an average performance are shown on the “Grey List”. Their appearance on this list may act as an incentive to improve and move to the “White List”. At the same time flags at the lower end of the “Grey List” should be careful not to neglect control over their ships and risk ending up on the “Black List” next year.

On this year’s “Grey List” a total of 20 flags is recorded. Last year the “Grey List” recorded 19 flags. New on the “Grey List” are the Islamic Republic of Iran, Kazakhstan, the Russian Federation, the United States of America, which were on the “White List” last year. A non-listed flag in last year’s entry and now on the “Grey List” this year is Tuvalu. New to the “Black List” is Ukraine.

A graph of the distribution of listed and non-listed flags indicates that only 0.8% of the ships inspected are from flags not listed on the WGB List.

## Ship type

In 2017 the top 5 detention rates for ships with a significant number of inspections are for: commercial yachts (7.7%), general cargo/multi-purpose ships at 7.7% (up from 7.2% in 2016); heavy load (4.3% up from 1.2%), bulk carrier at 3.0% (down from 3.4%) and at the same score other special activities and Ro-Ro passenger ship at 2.2%. Although “other” is not a specific type, the detention rate is high with 4.8%. The combination carrier (16.7%) shows a large percentage as well, but it is a score of one detention related to 6 inspections. Best performing ship types are NLS tankers with a zero detention rate and tug (1.2%).

## Performance of Recognized Organizations

For several years the Committee has closely monitored the performance of ROs acting on behalf of flags. To calculate the performance of the Recognized Organizations, the same formula to calculate the excess factor of the flags is used. A minimum number of 60 inspections per RO is needed before the performance is taken into account for the list. In 2017 34 ROs are recorded on the performance list. Compared with last year’s performance level, a small shift in RO performance in 2017 can be noticed. This year three organizations have been placed in the very low performing parts against none last year. Three organizations were placed in the low performing parts (4 last year) and 17 ROs have been placed in the medium part of the list (from 19 last year).

Details of the responsibility of Recognized Organizations for detainable deficiencies have been published since 1999. When one or more detainable deficiencies are attributed to a Recognized Organization in accordance with the Paris MoU criteria, it is recorded “RO responsible” and the RO is informed.

## Certificates & Documentation

The number of deficiencies recorded as related to ships' certificates, crew certificates and documents show a small decrease from 6,785 in 2016 to 6,648 in 2017. The significant increase from 2016 to 2015 (7.7%) has come to a halt. The relative part regarding the total deficiencies has a similar level of 16.3% related to 16.2% in 2016.

## Safety of Navigation

In 2017, deficiencies in Safety of Navigation accounted for 13.7% of all deficiencies recorded. The increase related to 2016 when the deficiencies were 12.5%, is probably due to the CIC Safety on Navigation. The number of deficiencies in Safety of Navigation increased from 5,221 in 2016 to 5,565 in 2017.

Out of 685 detentions recorded in 2017, 99 or 14.5% were considered RO related (13.9 in 2016).

## Refusal of access of ships

A total of 33 ships were refused access (banned) from the Paris MoU region in 2017. 32 for reasons of multiple detentions, 1 for failing to call at indicated repair yard. A number of ships remain banned from previous years. Several ships have been banned a second time after multiple detentions, resulting in a minimum banning period of 12 months. The total number of 33 is up from 20 in 2016 and 11 in 2015.

## Deficiencies per main category

The number of deficiencies in the following six areas accounted for approximately 68% of the total number of deficiencies. The trends are clarified below:-

### Fire safety

In 2017 deficiencies in fire safety accounted for 13.1% of all deficiencies recorded, compared to 12.9% in 2016. A further decrease of the number of deficiencies was recorded from 5,585 in 2015 to 5,393 in 2016 and 5,320 in 2017.

### Pollution prevention

The total number of deficiencies recorded in the several pollution prevention areas in 2017 were 2,007, a further decrease from 2,259 in 2015 and 2,056 in 2016. The relative part of the deficiencies regarding the total was 4.9% in 2017, the same as in 2016.

### Working and living conditions

Most deficiencies on working and living conditions have been found in the following areas. Health and safety and accident prevention (area 11) 3,230 (39.9% of all MLC deficiencies); food and catering (area 10) 1,295 (16.3%) hours of work and rest (area 6) 752 (9.5%); accommodation (area 8) 708 (8.9%) and seafarer's employment agreements (area 4) 646 (7.8%) deficiencies.



The percentage of deficiencies regarding working and living conditions, related to the total of deficiencies is 15.6%. A decrease from 16.1% in 2016. The total number of deficiencies in 2017 was 6,348, a decrease from 6,759 in 2016.

## Safety Management

The number of ISM related deficiencies was similar in 2017 (1,774) to 2016(1,838). The percentage regarding the total deficiencies remained the same (4.4%) categories of deficiencies 2015-2017

### 2015 – 2017 Deficiencies Main Group Category of deficiencies

#### Certificates & Documentation

Crew Certificates	1,288	3.1	1,576	3.8	1,562	3.8
Documents	2,617	6.3	2,871	6.9	2,751	6.8
Ship Certificates	2,404	5.7	2,338	5.6	2,335	5.7
Structural Condition	1,921	4.6	1,822	4.4	1,891	4.6
Water/Weather tight condition	1,917	4.6	2,037	4.9	1,775	4.4
Emergency Systems	2,504	6.0	2,167	5.2	2,051	5.0
Radio Communication	1,016	2.4	976	2.3	915	2.2
Cargo operations including equipment	209	0.5	220	0.5	194	0.5
Fire safety	5,588	13.4	5,393	12.9	5,320	13.1
Alarms	391	0.9	332	0.8	398	1.0

#### Working and Living Conditions (ILO 147) \*\*

Living Conditions	198	0.5	193	0.5	18	0.0
Working conditions	967	2.3	781	1.9	366	0.9

#### Working and Living Conditions (MLC, 2006)\*

MLC, 2006 Title 1	62	0.1	121	0.3	77	0.2
MLC, 2006 Title 2	404	1.0	553	1.3	383	0.9
MLC, 2006 Title 3	1,782	4.3	2,044	4.9	2,103	5.2
MLC, 2006 Title 4	2,839	6.8	3,067	7.3	3,401	8.3

On 20 August 2013 the Maritime Labour Convention 2006 entered into force. Only Member States of the Paris MoU that had ratified the MLC, 2006 on or before 20 August 2012 were entitled to conduct PSC inspections on MLC, 2006 requirements from 20 August 2013. For Member States of the Paris MoU that have not ratified the MLC, 2006, enforcement of the Merchant Shipping Convention (ILO 147) and the protocol of 1996 to the Merchant Shipping Convention (ILO P147) will initially continue.

#### Top 5 categories of deficiencies 2017

##### 2016- 2017 -Deficiencies

Safety of Navigation	5,221	12.47	5,565	13.66
Fire safety	5,393	12.88	5,320	13.06
Labour conditions-Health protection, medical care, social security	3,067	7.32	3,401	8.35

Lifesaving appliances 3,623 8.65 3,285 8.06  
Certificate & Documentation-Documents 2,871 6.86 2,751 6.75

2016-2017

ISM 1,839 4.39 1,774 4.35  
Fire doors/openings in fire-resisting divisions 1,079 2.58 1,024 2.51  
Nautical publications 1,049 2.51 929 2.28  
Charts 922 2.20 797 1.96  
Voyage or passage plan 497 1.19 594 1.46

Natalie Shaw  
Director, Employment Affairs